



Evaluation Summary



International
Labour
Office

Evaluation Unit

Strengthening labour inspection services

Quick Facts

Countries: *Angola, Brazil, China, India and South Africa*

Final Evaluation

Mode of Evaluation: *Independent*

Technical Area: *Labour Inspection*

Evaluation Management: *LAB/ADMIN*

Evaluation Team: *Mr Karstein Haarberg*

Project Start: *15 December 2011*

Project End: *18 March 2011*

Project Code: *INT/09/62/NOR*

Donor: *Norway 2,482,020 US dollars*

Keywords: *labour inspection, decent work*

Background & Context

Summary of the purpose, logic, structure

The Norwegian-funded ILO project “Strengthening labour inspection services” supported activities related to the Joint Immediate Outcomes and development of universal tools. The project aimed at strengthening and developing capacity building for labour inspection services in Angola, Brazil, China, India and South Africa. The project methodology included the conducting of labour inspection assessments and surveys when a specific need was expressed by the government. It also included a systematic capacity building of national labour inspection services through the development of national labour inspection action plans or programmes followed by a design of national training plans and national

training strategies. Measures and activities identified in the labour inspection plans, programmes and training strategies would be subsequently implemented.

Purpose, scope and clients of the evaluation

The objective of the evaluation is to assess the efficiency and extent of the implementation of the Norwegian funded project, “Strengthening labour inspection services”. It was also particularly important to evaluate the efficiency and impact of the methodological approach that was applied within the projects for the capacity building of national labour inspection services (against the background that it would be developed further for its future use).

Methodology of evaluation

The evaluation methodology triangulated the following forms of data: a) Existing information - the evaluation consultant reviewed existing documentation and related material; b) Participatory data collection - the evaluator participated in the “Strengthening labour inspection services experience-sharing workshop” in ITC Turin during late January 2011 - the evaluator also did workshop sessions and interviews with project stakeholders attending the Turin workshop. These sessions and interviews covered achievements and challenges, actions and recommendations; and c) Analysis - after returning from the ITC Turin workshop and receiving the responses from the questionnaire survey, the analyses culminated in the drafting of this report.

Main Findings & Conclusions

The project has progressed well, in all countries (particularly given its short operational time), towards the set objectives. In particular, immediate objective 1 has progressed well. Immediate objective 2 (related to social partners) has also progressed but has been, due to surrounding circumstances, less focused than objective 1.

The project is too short and small to have significant (tangible) impact on the development objectives. The project received good support from the ILO and national stakeholders. National governments were also supportive. The project benefitted from the preceding project, particularly regarding global products. These global products were used and developed further, including translation. The log-frames indicators were used in the progress report (January – June 2010), and were a bit better as a project management tool than the log-frame in the preceding project.

India

India had activities for developing a national training strategy at the central level. In addition, India had two regional projects, one in Bihar and one in Maharashtra. The one in Bihar focused around developing sustainable training capacity and the one in Maharashtra focused on assistance in policies for labour inspection and improved implementation.

Additionally, a labour inspection work programme on OSH with (Directorate General for Factory Advice Services and Labour Institutes) DGFASLI (including OSH inspection in ports) was undertaken. Awareness rising for the social partners was also a part of the programme activities. The achievements and results that the programme has created are:

The training strategy has been successful implemented, particularly in Bihar. The State has designed and delivered its own training for labour inspectors in a sustainable manner. In Maharashtra, there is a new framework for a

more effective labour inspection system that includes:

- a labour inspection policy
- labour inspection planning
- labour inspection guidelines and checklists
- training materials

China

ILO support to China arrived in a timely manner, that is to say, just after a review of China's labour inspection in 2009. The project was tied into the follow-up of the review conducted. It was China's first international cooperation project in the field of labour inspection. The key results from the project are:

The project contributed to a national labour inspection development strategy that provided assistance for the 12th five-year plan. A TOT programme was also initiated and a team of national experts built and strengthened their capacity. In addition, advocacy and information were disseminated. International good practices were promoted. Given the size of China's labour market and the size of the LI system (with 3,291 labour inspection agencies and more than 23,000 inspectors (OSH and some other entities not included)), even a modest impact on the system was considered to be good.

In regards to output, the project generated three publications (a bilingual LI brochure, a bilingual LI publication and the Chinese edition of the training manual). Surveys and consultation were conducted in two provinces. Three interventions (LI strategy in Ningxia, TOT in Jiujiang and new inspectors' training in Qinzhou) and three international activities (20 senior labour inspectors attended a training course in Turin; three national experts participated in a training and team building in Turin and 2 officials attended an exchange meeting in Brazil) were conducted. Three activities on OSH inspection (OSH inspection review, Symposium and TOT) were also undertaken as a part of the project.

The project had the following main achievements:

- Contributed to a national labour inspection development strategy (the 12th five-year plan including HRD);
- A TOT programme was initiated;
- A team of national experts was built and their capacity strengthened;
- Advocacy and the dissemination of information; and
- International good practices were learned and promoted.

South Africa

Following a request from the government for technical assistance, a labour administration and inspection audit was carried out in November 2009. The government intended to restructure its labour department, including labour inspection and asked the ILO for assistance. The project therefore started very quickly in South Africa. Findings and recommendations were included in a report, which was endorsed by the government in February 2010.

The major project achievements in South Africa are:

South Africa is committed towards the ratification of ILO Convention Nos. 81 and 129; therefore, parallel with the restructuring of the labour department, there is a strong will to embark on sustained capacity building in labour inspection. The proposals for restructuring the labour department have been fully endorsed. A process for the ratification of ILO Convention No. 81 was launched during the project period.

The ILO Technical Memorandum was taken as one of the basic guidelines for the DoL Repositioning Project. Feedback from stakeholders show that the input by the DoL participants on return from Turin, Spain, Portugal and Brazil have empowered the management of the labour inspectorate with regards to use of information technology, training strategy and networking with other emerging economy countries.

The DoL Headquarters was restructured. One major achievement relating to the restructuring was the creation of the Inspection and Enforcement Department (IED); this allowed for the reinforcement of the Central LI

Authority. The Inspection and Enforcement Service (IES) is now able to exert greater influence in planning and programming Labour Inspections. Labour inspection is regarded as a key pillar in Labour administration rather than a service provider.

All partners, governments, workers, employers involved in the project have become more sensitized towards the role of efficient labour inspection and are paying particular attention to the implementation of the Decent Work agenda in South Africa and its modernisation.

Gaps in labour administration and labour inspection have been identified and recognized by local partners. Training has been provided to managers, trainers at the national level, as well as to junior labour inspectors in one of the provinces. ILO training tools were adapted and widely distributed in South Africa. The LI trainers were empowered to use them for training of labour inspectors.

Brazil

In Brazil, the focus was on dissemination, training, production and exchange of good practices in labour inspection. The implementation of a labour inspection assessment was not deemed necessary by the government. This reflects the fact that Brazil's labour inspection is on a higher level than many middle-income countries and other countries supported by the ILO. Over the past several years, the Secretariat of Labour Inspection (SIT) has increased the number of civil servants in its ranks, improved its databases, and created special units, like the one to combat forced labour. These advances continue with the implementation of the New Methodology of Labour Inspection (April 2010), which represents an important shift from the last 23 years of institutionalization to a more results-oriented, strategic, quality-controlled, efficient and effective *modus operandi* for labour inspectors, thus moving away from a solely quantitative, numerically-oriented and finite enforcement.

A big success with the Brazilian project was the issuance of the publication series, “The Good Practice of Labour Inspection in Brazil”.

The mobilization of actors like the SINAIT (labour union) and the involvement of decentralized units was a big success in Brazil. As the stakeholders indicated to the evaluator, the cooperation with ILO Geneva, ITC Turin and the field, was appreciated by the stakeholders.

Angola

Angola is the country with the weakest labour inspection in the project portfolio of countries. Even though Angola has about 18 million inhabitants and 8.1 million in the economic active population, there were only 137 labour inspectors all together in the 18 provinces and they had only 21 vehicles.

Despite having the weakest levels of experience and LI services, the project appears to have effected a fundamental change to the Angolan system. Most Angolan labour inspectors were educated before 1989 and no training of significance had occurred since then. A group of new labour inspectors were recruited in 2010. This system gave new recruited staff little possibility in improving inspection services for the future. As the ILO programme was implemented, it improved the efficiency of the system and gave the new labour inspectors the chance to enhance their careers in the inspection field.

The following achievements were recorded:

Improved knowledge on labour inspection, OSH and training methodologies.

The government has put greater importance on building capacity in labour inspection but there is still a lack of awareness. For example, courts do not follow-up and sanction employers found to be violating workers’ rights and safety.

A group of inspectors who will become trainers of new inspectors has been created, and will likely be significant in further building LI capacity.

Participation of women inspectors in training activities successfully promoted and achieved (33% average).

Essential elements of the fulfilment strategy included a labour inspection assessment and the partial implementation of a subsequent labour inspection action plan, improving the labour inspectors’ knowledge basis through training and good practice exchange through study visits and international events.

Recommendations

The project has demonstrated success in implementing planned activities and has showed good results in a short period of time. The project, therefore, should continue. This is also the intention from the Norwegian donor, according to the evaluator, as it is not in line with good practice to run only a short-term project for one year or less. The project should come into the regular donor agreement with Norway, and gain longer-term stability in terms of budget and deliverables.

While the project should continue, not necessarily all the present countries should continue in the long term. Some countries, particularly China and Brazil, are relatively strong countries regarding labour inspection and other countries may, therefore, benefit more from the Norwegian project funding. ILO LBADMIN should revise the country coverage and make an exit strategy for the countries that should be phased out from the project.

The global products developed in the preceding project and this project has now come to phase where economics of scale is being realized. With relatively small cost, the global products can be distributed to more beneficiaries. Even if smaller changes and translations are needed, this can be done at small cost. The global products may have the potential to reach more beneficiaries by developing them as online packages. It is recommended that this is done in a feasible manner with continuity provided.